



European project "Environmental protection and sustainable development: building local capacities on solid waste management in Myanmar"

ပတ်ဝန်းကျင်ကာကွယ်ရေးနှင့် ရေရှည်တည်တံ့သော ဖွံ့ဖြိုးတိုးတက်မှု :

မြန်မာပြည်တွင် စွန့်ပစ်ပစ္စည်းစီမံခန့်ခွဲမှုအား ဒေသတွင်းစွမ်းရည်မြှင့်တင်ခြင်း

**Reference: EuropeAid/132216/L/ACT/MM  
DCI-NSAPVD/2012/310-773**

**The Involvement of minors in Solid Waste Management in Yangon**  
**Research conducted for CESVI in February and March 2014**



Olivia Franck

Master of Arts in International Relations

Partners - ဆောင်ရွက်သူများ



In collaboration with -  
ပူးပေါင်းဆောင်ရွက်သူ



Donors - အလှူရှင်များ



This project is funded by the European Union -  
ဤစီမံကိန်းအား ဥရောပသမဂ္ဂမှ ရန်ငွေထည့်ဝင်ပါသည်။

# **The Involvement of minors in Solid Waste Management in Yangon**

## **Research conducted for CESVI in February and March 2014**

This paper was prepared in the context of the EU funded project “Environmental protection and sustainable development: building local capacities on solid waste management in Myanmar”, co-implemented by Yangon City Development Committee - Pollution Control and Cleansing Department [PCCD], The City of Turin [CdT], ITHACA and CESVI.

The overall project explores innovative ways to improve the quality of solid waste management in Yangon and integrate principles of environmental protection into existing policies and practices.

Through working with Yangon city's Pollution Control and Cleansing Department, local communities and other stakeholders, it aims at:

- (1) strengthening the institutional and technical capacity of local authorities;
- (2) developing an information system for solid waste management;
- and
- (3) increasing community awareness of best practices in solid waste management.
- (4) The project targets three townships of Yangon: Tarmwe, Thingangyun and Hlaing Htayar.

This research is part of the third component of the project and aims to provide insight into the involvement of minors in SWM by observing the situation in Yangon in the light of international and local guidelines and interventions. It was carried out by Olivia Franck under the direction of Gaetano Romano, Solid Waste Management (SWM) Operational Coordinator, CESVI. Mentoring and support was provided by Judy Hagan, Consultant for CESVI. The field research could run smoothly thanks to Cesvi Awareness Campaign Coordinator Min Nay Han, to his precious field knowledge and to his leadership of the Community Facilitators team. Zin Mar, CESVI SWM Monitoring and Evaluation Officer, provided central support during each field visit together with CESVI Community Facilitators and U Tin Naing. Ms. Yin Lelt Aung, Terre des hommes Italia Psychosocial Coordinator, kindly provided key insight drawn from her field experience.

Olivia Franck

Master of Arts in International Relations

# INDEX

<b>I.</b>	<b>Presentation of the research.....</b>	<b>p.4</b>
1.	Rationale and objectives .....	p.4
2.	Methodology .....	p.4
	a. <u>Literature study and interviews with NGOs working on Child Protection in Yangon</u>	
	b. <u>Case study: field research in a selected Township, Thingangyun</u>	
3.	Introduction.....	p. 5
	a. <u>Context and definitions</u>	
	b. <u>Structure</u>	
	c. <u>Constraints</u>	
<b>II.</b>	<b>International and national legal framework.....</b>	<b>p.7</b>
1.	International conventions and norms concerning the work of minors .....	p.7
	a. <u>The Conventions</u>	
	b. <u>The minimum working age</u>	
	c. <u>Hazardous Work as a Worst Form of Child Labour</u>	
2.	Myanmar guidelines on Child Rights and the work of children .....	p.9
	a. <u>The Child Law of 1993</u>	
	b. <u>Myanmar Labour Law</u>	
<b>III.</b>	<b>Occupational Health and Safety in Solid Waste Management .....</b>	<b>p.11</b>
	a. <u>Health and Safety in Solid Waste Management</u>	
	b. <u>The particular vulnerability of children to hazardous work</u>	
<b>IV.</b>	<b>Field research: the involvement of minors in Solid Waste Management in Thingangyun township .....</b>	<b>p.14</b>
1.	Introduction .....	p.14
	a. <u>The involvement of minors in Solid Waste Management in Yangon</u>	
	b. <u>Interview ethics and child protection approach</u>	
2.	The involvement of minors at the first stage: waste picking .....	p.15
	a. <u>An overview, including insight shared by Terre des hommes Italia</u>	
	b. <u>Waste pickers: limited field research in Thingangyun</u>	

<b>3. Young workers at collecting shops .....</b>	<b>p.16</b>
a. <u>Overview</u>	
b. <u>Case study n° 1: Small collecting shop, 2 workers, visited on 19.02.14</u>	
c. <u>Case study n° 2: small collecting shop, 2 workers, visited on 06.03.14</u>	
d. <u>Case study n° 3: small collecting shop, 3 workers, visited on 06.03.14</u>	
e. <u>Case study n°4 small collecting shop, 4 workers, visited on 06.03.14</u>	
f. <u>Commentary on the work of children in collecting shops</u>	
<b>4. The involvement of minors in recycling shops and small recycling factories ...</b>	<b>p.21</b>
a. <u>Overview</u>	
b. <u>Case study n° 5: tin recycling shop, 20 workers, visited on 14.02.14</u>	
c. <u>Case study n° 6: bottle-cap factory visited on 19.02.14</u>	
d. <u>Commentary on the work of children in recycling shops and recycling factories</u>	
<b>5. Additional observations and conclusion .....</b>	<b>p.25</b>
<b>V. Recommendations to the SWM project, to future developers of SWM in Yangon and to researchers .....</b>	<b>p.26</b>
<b>VI. Bibliography .....</b>	<b>p.27</b>
<b>VII. Annex .....</b>	<b>p.29</b>

## **List of acronyms**

SWM: Solid Waste Management  
 YCDC: Yangon City Development Committee (administrative body of Yangon)  
 PCCD: Pollution Control and Cleansing Department (YCDC body responsible for SWM)  
 CESVI: Cooperazione e Sviluppo Onlus  
 ILO: International Labour Organization  
 UNICEF: United Nations Children’s Fund  
 UN CRC: United Nations Convention on the Rights of Children  
 INGO: International Non Governmental Organisation  
 OHS: Occupational Health and Safety  
 CS: Collecting Shop  
 RS: Recycling Shop  
 RF: Recycling Factory

# I. Presentation of the research

## 1. Rationale and objectives

Children are involved in the collection, processing and disposal of waste in Yangon. Such activities have the likelihood to be hazardous, and health and safety risks can affect children particularly strongly. The objective of the study is to provide insight into child labour issues relevant to the SWM programme by observing the situation in Yangon in the light of international and local guidelines and interventions. This analysis is necessary in order to provide the SWM project with a grasp of an observable but poorly documented issue, and to support further discussion with other Myanmar stakeholders. It opens the way to further research so that a wider range of documentation can be available in the future.

The field research section aims to:

- identify the stages of SWM in which children are involved
- characterise the young workers (age, family situation...)
- depict the working conditions of minors in recycling (under 18-year-olds)
- describe health and safety hazards in the minors' work situation and environment

## 2. Methodology

### a. Literature study and interviews with NGOs working on Child Protection in Yangon

This research began with a preliminary literature review that informed the first steps to be taken in this study on the work of children in SWM. It provided an orientation to the field research but was not central to this report. A bibliography is nevertheless included at the end.

Several INGOs were consulted in preparation for this study's field research. Discussions were held, among others, with experts from Terre des hommes Italia, Save the Children, and World Vision.

### b. Case study: field research Thingangyun township, Yangon

The case studies presented here focus on Yangon's Thingangyun township. This township was selected among the three pilot townships in which the SWM programme is being implemented (Thingangyun, Tarmwe and Hlaing Tharyar) since CESVI had the necessary prior field knowledge in place as well as Community Facilitators ready to enable the research. Thingangyun was selected because it presented the best potential for field research: Tarmwe is wealthier and has few collecting shops (CSs) and appears not to host any recycling shop (RS) or recycling factory (RF), whereas Hlaing Tharyar was not easily accessible to the research team. Moreover, Thingangyun represents a middle ground between the two other townships in terms of wealth and development. The case study cannot be generalised to the whole of Yangon city but provides a representative depiction nonetheless. Child protection experts, SWM actors and Community Facilitators have validated many of the observations made in Thingangyun as being observable in other parts of Yangon.

The case study is based on a qualitative methodology, using preliminary field observations with CESVI SWM Community Facilitators as well as 46 personal semi-structured interviews, both conducted during 5 days with actors directly involved in SWM. These observations were informed by and completed with Community Facilitator previous experience of the field as well as interviews conducted with INGOs. Most interviews were made in CSs, RSs and RFs, once it appeared that many children were working in those places. Three publications proved particularly useful in preparation for the field research: the International Labour Organisation's (ILO) 'Practical Guide to Child Labour Reporting' (2006), the ILO and UNICEF 'Manual on Child Labour Rapid Assessment Methodology' (2005) as well as Oxfam's 'Conducting semi-structured interviews' (2012).

### 3. Introduction

#### a. Context and definitions

Visitors to Yangon can notice that minors are widely employed in teashops around the city, and those who have access to households can tell that young girls and boys are commonly hired as domestic workers. Waste management is perhaps a less obvious but definitely relevant sector for observing the work of children. While visiting the less advantaged townships of Yangon, the presence of children collecting waste off the streets, a collecting bag in their hand, becomes obvious. This research sheds light on the involvement of minors in waste management, in particular in the recycling sector, in Yangon. Asia is the world's region with the highest number of child labourers in general and hazardous child labour in particular, and Myanmar is one of the countries with the highest rates of child labour<sup>1</sup>. However, there is no precise, consistent knowledge of child labour patterns in Myanmar. In November 2013, it was announced that the Government of Myanmar would cooperate with the ILO to conduct the first National Labour Force Survey (LFS) since 1990, in part to analyse child labour patterns in the country<sup>2</sup>. This occurrence could lead to a better knowledge of and more research on the issue. As recently as 2012, the ILO started lifting restrictions on Myanmar's full participation in the organisation's activities. Myanmar had not received any ILO technical support since 1999, except in the area of forced labour, which was deemed a priority. Subsequently, 2013 saw the complete lifting of restrictions to Myanmar's participation to activities, as well as the Government of Myanmar signing the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention<sup>3</sup>. NGOs that have been working on child labour in Myanmar have led projects and produced key knowledge predominantly in the areas of child soldiers and child trafficking, which are widely viewed as the most pressing child labour issues, but there are very few published reports on other forms of child labour at present.

These recent developments should lead to more interventions in the domain of children's work in general and the worst forms of child labour in particular in the coming years. The ILO and other international organisations consider child labour to be any form of work done by children that is deemed unacceptable, according to certain agreed-upon guidelines. 'Child labour' is a heavily charged expression which, when used in this study, will not serve to designate the work of children in general, but only the type of work considered harmful according to international guidelines and relevant literature. The ILO's perspective is that "*children in child labour*" are a subset of "*children in employment*"<sup>4</sup>. They include those in employment below the minimum age, excluding children in permissible light work, and those in the "worst forms of child labour". Consequently, children can "be in child labour" up to the age of 18, not 15, because the type of work or work conditions makes it a worst form of child labour. In particular, this study will focus on hazardous work, that is, work that is done in hazardous conditions or that includes hazardous tasks. In the world, most of the children in the worst forms of child labour are doing hazardous work, a form of work that will be described more precisely in section II. 1.<sup>5</sup> It is interesting to note that in the world, boys outnumber girls across all age groups in hazardous child labour.<sup>6</sup> This research will also make some observations regarding gender and the involvement of children in hazardous work in SWM in Yangon.

According to ILO definitions, and in this study, children are considered to be in employment whether they work in the formal or informal economy, whether they are paid or not, whether they are in a family setting or not.<sup>7</sup> Work done without pay for family members can therefore potentially constitute child labour as much as any other kind of work.

---

<sup>1</sup> 'Marking progress against child labour – Global estimates and trends 2000-2012' (2013a) International Labour Office, International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour, Geneva, p.17; p.20.

<sup>2</sup> Press release, ILO, November 14, 2013.

<sup>3</sup> Press releases, ILO, 19<sup>th</sup> of December 2013 and 18<sup>th</sup> of June 2013.

<sup>4</sup> ILO, 2013a, p.45.

<sup>5</sup> *ibid*, p.6

<sup>6</sup> 'Employers' and Workers' Handbook on Hazardous Child Labour' (2001) International Labour Office, International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour, Geneva, p.6

<sup>7</sup> ILO, 2013, p.45

## b. Structure

This study begins with a presentation of various international and local guidelines and legal norms applicable to the case study. It goes on to present the health and safety hazards and risks that SWM workers can face in Yangon. Having set this framework, and in an attempt to better understand the phenomena, it goes on to a case study that focuses on three stages of the waste management and recycling process in Yangon's Thingangyun township: waste collecting, work in CSs, and work in small RSs and RFs. For various reasons, these stages are the ones in which most children are thought to be involved as workers in SWM. These three areas should not be understood as clearly separate stages, since the work done by children in RSs and in small RFs can be very similar, for instance. Moreover, the field observations suggest that children are involved at other points in the SWM chain.

## c. Constraints

This study constitutes an introductory depiction of the field and the research dealt with many constraints. Firstly, the work of children, although an accepted norm in Myanmar, can be a sensitive topic since there is a notion that external observers may be critical of that practice. Although some interviewees showed no inhibition at discussing the work of children, some shop owners showed unease, proved to conceal information, or even refused access to their premises. One way to avoid misinformation was to cross-check with the workers who usually showed no apparent unease at speaking with CESVI Community Facilitators. When it came to discussing the issue with INGOs, some interviewees were very careful in sharing their experiences. Another problem was the difficulty to conduct field research in Yangon as a foreigner. Similarly, some areas such as dumping sites could not be accessed easily and required official permission.

This study does not include detailed field research on the activities of so-called 'street children'. This is partly due to lack of time and resources: children are scattered around the city and follow irregular activity patterns. Concerning this type of children's involvement in SWM, information was mostly collected from experiences of INGOs and interviews with shop owners who buy from 'street children' daily.

## **II. International and national legal frameworks**

### **1. International conventions and norms concerning the work of minors**

#### a. The Conventions

The United Nations structure has established several legal instruments to set international standards on the work of children. These conventions, which have been ratified by a majority of state governments, fulfil the important function of proposing definitions from which to work forward. Two conventions, established by the International Labour Organisation (ILO), are most directly relevant to the work of children and to this study. These conventions are:

- The Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention (No.182), 1999
- The Convention on the Minimum Age for Admission to Employment (No.138), 1973

The government of Myanmar ratified the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention in December 2013<sup>8</sup> and it has not yet been translated into national strategies and laws. Myanmar is not a signatory of the Minimum Age Convention, however, a text that sets the minimum acceptable age for different categories of work.

---

<sup>8</sup> only two months before this research was conducted.

The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UN CRC, 1989), signed by the government of Myanmar in 1991, is also relevant to this research. INGOs working in the field of child protection in Myanmar consider it as a fundamental guideline that they attempt to follow and promote. It specifies that children have the right “to be protected from economic exploitation and from performing any work that is likely to be hazardous or to interfere with the child’s education or be harmful to the child’s health or physical, mental, spiritual, moral or social development” (Article 32). It also states that children have the right to education, to rest, to leisure, to play, to recreation, and the right to be cared for and to have regular contact with their parents and peers. ***All of the children interviewed in this study were doing an activity that was incompatible with some of these rights.*** The relation between education and the work of children is not a straightforward one, however. Although this issue cannot be discussed at length here, it is important to know that education is not accessible at full extent to all in Myanmar. Taking children out of work would not necessarily bring them (back) to education.

#### b. The minimum working age

Although the Minimum Age Convention has not been ratified by the government of Myanmar, it is a core ILO convention, which means that ILO Member States, even if they have not ratified the Convention, have an obligation arising from their membership in the ILO to respect and promote its principles. The Minimum Age Convention marks out minimum ages for three categories of work:

- *18 years old for “hazardous work” (possible exceptions for developing countries: 16)*  
“any type of employment or work which by its nature or the circumstances in which it is carried out is likely to jeopardise the health, safety or morals of young persons shall not be less than 18 years”
- *15 years old for “ordinary work”(possible exceptions for developing countries: 14)*
- *13 years old for “light work” (possible exceptions for developing countries: 12)*  
“National laws or regulations may permit the employment or work of persons 13 to 15 years of age on light work which is
  - (a) not likely to be harmful to their health or development; and
  - (b) not such as to prejudice their attendance at school, their participation in vocational orientation or training programmes approved by the competent authority or their capacity to benefit from the instruction received”

As they ratify the Convention, developing countries can set slightly lower ages than those recommended by the convention. Since Myanmar has not ratified the Convention, this exceptional situation will not be taken into account here.

#### c. Hazardous work as a Worst Form of Child Labour

The Convention on the Worst forms of Child Labour defines forms of work that are to be prohibited for persons under the age of 18. As per Article 3, the worst forms of child labour are defined as:

- (a) all forms of slavery or practices similar to slavery, such as the sale and trafficking of children, debt bondage, and serfdom and forced or compulsory labour, including forced or compulsory recruitment of children for use in armed conflict,
- (b) the use, procurement or offering of a child for prostitution, for the production of pornography or for pornographic purposes,
- (c) the use, procuring or offering of a child for illicit activities, in particular for the production and trafficking of drugs as defined in international treaties, and

- (d) work which, by its very nature or the circumstances in which it is carried out, is likely to harm the health, safety or morals of children. [*hazardous work*]

It is important to note the difference between hazardous work (d) and the other worst forms of child labour (a to c): hazardous aspects of hazardous work can sometimes be modified or removed to make it acceptable work, while the other forms can never be acceptable under any circumstance. This difference is important for this study: since hazardous work is to be observed in SWM in Yangon, then this study can point out areas for improvement in work conditions.

The ILO's Worst Forms of Child Labour Recommendation (No. 190) of 1999 forms the non-binding guidelines that accompany Convention No. 182, giving further indication as to what work should be prohibited. The items can be: (a) tasks which are hazardous, and (b) situations which are hazardous. It specifies that children (under 18 years old) are said to be in the worst forms of child labour if they are exposed to:

- “ - physical, psychological or sexual abuse,
- work underground, under water, at dangerous heights, confined spaces,
- work with dangerous machinery, equipment and tools,
- manual handling or transport of heavy loads,
- an unhealthy environment exposing workers to hazardous substances, agents or processes, or to temperatures, noise, levels or vibration damaging to health,
- work under difficult circumstances, including long hours, or during the night, and
- unreasonable confinement on the employer's premises”

These definitions will help examine whether the work of children in SWM and recycling in Yangon is considered acceptable in the light of international standards. Myanmar Law is not as restrictive: while the Child Law of 1993 followed from the UN CRC, labour law pertaining to the work of minors predates relevant international conventions by far.

## **2. Myanmar guidelines on child rights and the work of minors**

### **a. The Child Law of 1993**

Child protection NGOs refer to the 1993 Child Law as the main reference to child rights in Myanmar law. This law cites as its main aim “to implement the rights of the child recognized in the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child” (article 3). However, it essentially defines a child as “a person who has not attained the age of 16 years” and youth as “a person who has attained the age of 16 years but has not attained the age of 18 years” (article 2). The Child Law therefore adopts a definition of the child that is stricter than the definition proposed by the UN CRC. Persons older than 15 years old but younger than 18 years old (16 and 17-year-olds) are not considered to be children in Myanmar Law, and therefore are not entitled to the same protection as the under 16 year-olds. At the start of 2014, the 1993 Child Law is still in a revision process entailing a multi-stakeholder consultation requiring the input of international and local NGOs. According to Save the Children and World Vision Child Protection specialists, this is a very lengthy process that might bring a new law replacing the 1993 Child Law altogether, by 2015 or 2016. Although it is said that the new law will raise the age of children from 16 to 18 years of age, in accordance with the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, this change is contested by some local actors who see 16 to 18-year-olds as responsible and accountable persons when confronted to the law. The age at which a child becomes an adult socially and legally depends on each culture.

One section of the Child Law may apply to this study:

“Whoever commits any of the following acts shall, on conviction be punished with imprisonment for a term which may extend to 6 months or with fine which may extend to Kyats

1,000<sup>9</sup> or with both: (a) employing or permitting a child [under 16] to perform work which is hazardous to the life of the child or which may cause disease to the child or which is harmful to the child's moral character”

Overall, the Child Law focuses mainly on children's relation to the judicial system. It provides a definition of a child but does not discuss working standards. Myanmar Labour Law addresses this area more specifically.

#### b. Myanmar Labour Law

Myanmar Labour Law pertaining to the work of children is more relevant than but predates the Child Law of 1993. As a result, some discrepancies arise and the legal framework is not clear to all actors involved. Two texts are particularly relevant to the work of children in SWM in Myanmar: the Factories Act and the Shops and Establishments Act, both of 1951. The Factories Act is particularly useful since it is considered to be an important legal text for Occupational Health and Safety (OHS). NGOs consulted on the issue agree to say that while shop and factory owners may be aware that there exists a minimum age for employment and other legal requirements, they tend not to know further details about the Myanmar Labour Law and their obligations when hiring children. Nevertheless, the two acts provide some guidelines as to which work is legally acceptable in Myanmar.

Firstly, both acts prohibit children under the age of 13 from working in factories and shops. They define children as persons under 16 years old and youth as persons older than 15 years old but younger than 18 years old. According to these acts, “children” who are allowed to work under certain conditions are those who are 13, 14 or 15 years old. 16 and 17-year-olds are called “youth” and can work under other conditions. The following section presents selected terms that will be useful to the field research.

#### *The Factories Act of 1951*

- Children need to provide a medical certificate to the employer stating that they are physically fit to work in a factory in order to work in a factory, and this letter has to be renewed yearly. They can only work up to 4 hours per day or 5 hours including a break, and will not work between the hours of 6:00 pm and 6:00 am.
- Youth also need a doctor's certificate in order to be allowed to work in a factory. The doctor shall state whether the person should work in the same conditions as a child or in the conditions as an adult.
- The manager must know the name of the working children and the name of their parents, and keep a record that an inspector can check at all times.
- Working hours for adults are a maximum of 8 hours per day and 44 hours per week. If there is a serious incident leading to death or near-death, a letter must be sent to the chief inspector.
- Factories must close on Sundays.

**Note:** The act defines a factory as any premise “where a ‘manufacturing process’ is carried out by 10 or more workers using power or 20 or more workers without any power.” As will be explained below, many RSs therefore enter this definition.

#### *The Shops and Establishments Act of 1951*

- This Act prohibits the work of children under 13 years old but does not set working hours and conditions for children above 13 years old that are different than that of adults.
- Workers may work for a maximum of 8 hours per day or 10 hours per day with a break, and 48 hours per week.
- Restaurants can require workers to stay until 1 am but the rest of the shops must be closed by 9:30 pm. There are no other specifications regarding opening times.
- Workers must be allowed to break for 30 minutes every 5 hours.

---

<sup>9</sup> In March 2014, 1,000 Myanmar Kyats are roughly equivalent to 0.75 €

### III. Solid Waste Management Occupational Health and Safety

#### 1. Health and safety hazards and risks in SWM

Much of the research done on OHS in SWM in developing countries focuses on the work of so-called ‘scavengers’, or waste pickers, in particular at the level of dumpsites. Although the present report does not focus on this type of work specifically, it is very important for the SWM2 project team to be aware of the risks faced by SWM workers at all levels, concerning both formal and informal workers. The following table presents the main hazards and risks that SWM workers potentially face in Yangon. A hazard is anything with the potential to do harm, and a risk is the likelihood of potential harm from that hazard actually occurring <sup>10</sup>. While this section focuses on the risks linked to the activities observed in the field research (CS, RS and RF workers), it includes other works in order to inform the SWM project of the potential risks faced by other SWM actors. It maps out some easily observable and identifiable hazards. In the future, risks will have to be assessed with quantitative (also medical) analysis. This table is not exhaustive and some categories may overlap. It provides a framework for field observations in this research.

**Health and Safety Hazards and Risks in SWM and recycling in Yangon <sup>11</sup>**

Types of activity	Hazards (OHS categories)	Risks
Having <b>contact</b> with waste (in particular: waste collectors, CS, RS, dumpsites)	<p>- <b>Physical:</b> sharp objects, in particular metal and glass, including needles and broken or sharp pieces. Lack of treatment in case of accidents induced by these hazards.</p> <p>- <b>Biological:</b> physical contact with bacteria, parasites and viruses present in fecal matter and decomposing household waste, including animal flesh and medical waste such as syringes, containers and bloodied cloths and other bodily fluids</p> <p>- <b>Chemical:</b> physical contact with toxic gases, liquids (solvents, cleaners...), metals (asbestos, mercury, silica, lead...) fumes (vehicle exhaust, glues), agro-chemicals (pesticides, herbicides and insecticides), explosives.</p>	<p>- cuts, puncture wounds, infections</p> <p>- tetanus</p> <p>- parasitic and enteric infections, Tetanus, Hepatitis infection...</p> <p>- contact dermatitis, scabies, sores, itching, psoriasis, severe rash...</p> <p>- chemical burns, lead/mercury poisoning, headaches, nausea, respiratory diseases, skin conditions</p>

<sup>10</sup> ‘Children in Hazardous Work – What we know, What we need to do’ (2011), International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour, ILO, Geneva, p.13.

<sup>11</sup> The table draws from two sources:

- Cointreau, S., (2006) ‘Occupational and Environmental Health Issues of Solid Waste Management – Special Emphasis on Middle- and Lower-Income Countries’ *The World Bank Group, Urban Sector Board, Urban Papers*
- ‘The Tripartite Process of determining hazardous child labour: Guide for facilitators - Eliminating hazardous child labour: Step by step’ (2012) International Labour Organization, International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC), Geneva.

<b>Types of activity</b>	<b>Hazards</b> (OHS categories)	<b>Risks</b>
<p><b>Transforming</b> the manually or with small machines. (in particular: RS, RF)</p>	<p>- <b>Physical</b> : dangerous machines and instruments, cuts with metal, untreated cuts - <b>Chemical</b>: contact with toxic liquids, paint ...</p>	<p>- cuts, burns - tetanus, infections - risk of being caught in a machine, struck by an object - respiratory diseases, skin conditions ...</p>
<p><b>Processing</b> the waste and spending vast amounts of time at dumpsites</p>	<p>- organic gases, pressurized gas containers at dumpsites, ...) - burning hazardous wastes</p>	<p>- explosions and fires at dumpsites, landslides, additional dangers of an unsafe environment at dumpsites - airborne contamination (such as biodegradation gases, particulates and bioaerosols- carbon monoxide poisoning - lead poisoning from burning of materials with lead-containing batteries, paint, and solders - headaches and nausea from anoxic conditions where disposal sites have high methane, carbon dioxide and carbon monoxide concentrations - respiratory illness from ingesting particulates, bio-aerosols, and volatile organics during waste collection and from working in smoky an dusty conditions at open dumps</p>
<p><b>All activities</b></p>	<p>- <b>Physical</b> : hot temperatures, noise, vibrations, working from a high or dangerous position, disordered workplace, car traffic  - <b>Ergonomic</b>: lifting, carrying or moving heavy loads, repetitive or forceful movements, work postures that are uncomfortable or which must be held for a long period of time.  - <b>Psychological</b> : stress, intimidation, harassment, abuse  - <b>Working conditions</b>: long working hours, work in isolation, night work  - <b>Social hazards</b>: isolation from family</p>	<p>- headaches, fractures, sprains, wounds from falling, injury or death from moving vehicles  - back and joint injuries from lifting heavy waste-filled containers and from sitting in awkward positions  - a wide range of serious risks for all workers, in particular for the development of the child</p>

***Death and permanent disability are risks potentially induced by all of the above stated hazards***

There are simple steps that can partly remove the above stated hazards, thereby diminishing health and safety risks. For example, one simple and crucial way in which bacterial and chemical hazards can be diminished is by limiting direct contact between dangerous substances and the workers' skin and body with the use of gloves, masks, closed shoes and covering clothes. Workers employed by SWM service providers are perhaps more likely to wear gloves and masks, while private and informal workers are potentially more readily exposed to substances. Another step to take is to give workers the means to hand-wash, clean themselves and

protect and disinfect any cuts. It is also crucial to prevent any direct contact with hazardous waste, including medical and chemical wastes. While the hazards can be managed by protecting solid waste workers, eliminating hazardous waste altogether entails more than behavioural modification. Hazardous wastes need to be separated at the source for separate collection and disposal.

Eliminating other hazards includes adequate physical protection for chopping knife and sharp object handlers and safer machines for machine users. Ensuring limited working hours, allowing for outside contact, breaks and connection with the family, are also necessary steps towards ensuring solid waste workers health and safety. The first step towards such solutions is a general observation of the current state of occupational health and safety, which is the focus of this research. Overall, priority should be given to removing the hazards that children are facing since they are generally more vulnerable to them than healthy adults.

## 2. The particular vulnerability of children to hazardous work

International guidelines insist on prohibiting the involvement of persons under 18 years old in hazardous work. Children are impacted by hazardous work more strongly than adults. In addition to health and safety risks, children face development risks. As a reminder, the hazardous work of children is defined as: “work which, by its very nature or the circumstances in which it is carried out, is likely to harm the health, safety or morals of children.” (see ILO Convention on the Worst Forms of Child Labour). The following box highlights the physiological factors behind greater health and development risks for children.

### Children...<sup>12</sup>

- have thinner skin, so toxic substances are more easily absorbed;
- breathe faster and more deeply, so can inhale more airborne pathogens and dusts;
- dehydrate more easily due to their larger skin surface and faster breathing;
- absorb and retain heavy metals (lead, mercury) in the brain more easily which can disrupt the endocrine system that plays a key role in growth and development, retarding intellectual development, and affecting the whole nervous system;
- require more sleep and rest for proper development;
- have less-developed thermoregulatory systems rendering them more sensitive to heat and cold;
- have less developed metabolic pathways to detoxify and excrete toxins.

In addition to this, children are also simultaneously less able to recognize, defend and protect themselves against health and safety hazards and risks, and are therefore potentially more affected morally, psychologically, and socially.

## IV. Field research: the involvement of minors in Solid Waste Management in Thingangyun Township

### 1. Introduction

#### a. The involvement of minors in solid Waste Management in Yangon

This study sheds light on the involvement of minors in SWM and recycling in one of the SWM2 project’s pilot townships, Thingangyun. Before pinpointing the activities in which children are involved, it is

<sup>12</sup> ILO, 2012b, p.47; Cointreau, 2006, p.1.

necessary to give a short overview of SWM in Yangon at this point. This description will focus on household waste flow since Thingangyun is a primarily residential area.

Waste production and segregation starts at the household level. Depending on the area of town and on the household, waste is either deposited at intermediary stations (large open bins and brick tanks) or collected by PCCD cart pushers, PCCD trucks or private cart pushers for a fee that can vary. Recyclables, on the other hand, can be sold to private cart pushers who usually work for small CSs or RSs from which they hire the carts. Some households dump their waste in the streets or unused land illegally. Some waste pickers, including children who live in the streets, pick recyclables from the streets or from bins and sell them to CSs for a living. PCCD trucks collect waste from intermediary stations at night and, sometimes after having sold off some recyclables, bring them to public dumpsites where a final segregation takes place. At the dumping sites, the small proportion of recyclables left is sold to shops and the rest of the waste is accumulated there.

The recycling sector is a mostly private, partly informal industry in which a significant number of children are involved. CSs and RSs often hire adult workers to collect recyclables from households or from ordinary shops and hire both children and adults to segregate and/or clean and process the recyclables. Once the recyclables are sorted, the small CSs either sell them off to bigger CSs (collecting wholesalers in the industrial zones) or to RSs, directly or through an intermediary transporter. The RSs usually specialise in one recyclable and process it either into simple finished products or into raw materials for RFs. Small RFs also hire minors to produce finished products out of recyclables. Recyclables that have reached collecting wholesalers are then sold on to factories that use them as raw material. Although big CSs mostly hire men who are more adapted to heavy lifting, some children are also seen to work there.

#### b. Interview ethics and child protection approach

Throughout this field research, special care was given to approaching the workers in a respectful and ethical manner throughout all stages of observation, interviewing, and reporting.

Upon arrival at work places, the field research team requested approval from shop or factory owners to interview workers and take photographs. When parents were present, they were asked for permission to interview their children before the workers themselves were asked. While conducting interviews, interviewers made sure to address children in a friendly and respectful manner, starting by presenting themselves and their work. The interviews were conducted protecting the right to dignity, confidentiality and the best interest of the child. The interviewers would sit or stand at the child's level while speaking and make sure not to interrupt their work if possible. Interviewers listened carefully to replies and tried to ask open questions in order to let the children express their own points of views and feelings.

While interviewers always asked for children's names, and the children seemed to appreciate being asked, these names were not included in this report. Moreover, photographs were taken with worker approval. The research team will not circulate photographs where children can be identified beyond the SWM project.

Annex n°1 of this paper details these guidelines, which have been circulated to the team in English and in Myanmar language.

## **2. The involvement of minors at the first stage: waste picking**

#### a. An overview, including insight shared by Terre des hommes Italia

There are several categories of informal waste collectors working in the streets of Yangon at the same time as PCCD staff who operate orange carts. There are private individuals pushing carts from household to household in order to buy recyclable waste and provide a garbage delivery service that may or may not be charged depending on quantity and content. These waste collectors generally are adults who deliver a service to households. The third widely observable category of collectors who sell recyclable waste to CSs is

constituted by children who use big bags to collect recyclable waste where they find it. Unlike other waste collectors, these children do not buy the objects from individuals but tend to acquire them without payment by finding them on the street. This activity seems to be performed by children commonly referred to as 'street children', that is to say, children who do not live in a household but live in the street, sometimes in groups. They are an informal part of the SWM system in Yangon. The team also encountered children who were working for their parents who were themselves waste collectors.

Together with begging, waste picking is a central income-generating activity for 'street children' in Yangon, although it is not usually as profitable as the former. While begging allows them to make around 5'000 Kyats per day, waste collection provides them with a daily average of 3'000 Kyats. Regarding background information to this activity, key information was provided by the Psychosocial Coordinator at Terre des hommes Italia. In the past, in a previous function, this expert conducted interviews with street children, which allowed her to provide this research with elements on these children's situation. For instance, she explained that many street children, an estimated 70% of whom are boys, consciously run away from their families living in the countryside or in peri-urban areas in order to reach the city to make money. Sometimes this happens as a result of abuse at home, sometimes as an escape from situations of extreme poverty. Once in the streets of Yangon, waste picking becomes a way of earning a daily amount of money that usually has to be spent during the day since the children have no means of securing that money for longer periods of time. Two children were briefly interviewed by the research team, and their perspectives confirmed the valuable insight provided by Terre des hommes Italia.

During field research, several CS and RS managers explained that they did not buy recyclables from 'street children' because they did not want to support homeless children or because they only provided them with bad quality, dirty waste. Some shopkeepers explained that they did buy from them, but paid them less than other collectors. Children organize their waste-gathering activities in several ways. Some children tend to perform this activity in groups, bringing collected bottles together and selling them as a whole. Other children work for adults who claim to have 'adopted' them. Terre des hommes Italia Psychosocial Coordinator has met children who were being used as income providers, together with other children, by women who told them they were their 'mothers'. As a response to their affection or provision of a shelter, the children were expected to bring back money to that person daily. While this constitutes a punishable offence, the fine for committing it is low, which allows for anybody to get away with such abuse, as this expert explained. What is more, she has noticed that many children who live from picking waste have skin diseases, possibly as a result of daily physical contact with waste. These observations suggest that waste-picking is detrimental to their health. When asked, Terre des hommes Italia Psychosocial Coordinator said she did not believe that many children pick waste at the dumping sites.

#### b. Waste pickers: limited field research in Thingangyun

Field research with street children was particularly limited for several reasons. First, it was not easy to locate the children since they move during the day, following irregular patterns. Another limitation was the fact that these children are inclined to conceal information from interviewers. Not only do their living conditions make them inclined to distrust people they have just met, such as interviewers, they also tend to invent parts of their story in an attempt to persuade people to donate money, according to Terre des hommes Italia Psychosocial Coordinator. As this expert explained, the 'street children' she interviewed tended to 'romanticise' their stories, often stating that they sent back money to ill parents, when in reality they have no contact with their family whom they fled from and spent the money for themselves. Having been given this warning, two informal interviews were nevertheless conducted with the only children met during the research which seemed to live in the street and live from waste-picking. They provided the research team with an illustration of the information provided by Terre des hommes Italia, but did not lead to further observations.

### 3. Young workers at collecting shops

#### a. Overview

There are 11 small and medium collecting shops operating with a license in Thingangyun township, and many more who operate without. Exact numbers are unknown and difficult to evaluate as informal businesses are often located in backyards or inside houses. Their main function is to act as intermediaries either between households and bigger CSs, or between smaller CSs and factories. CSs vary a lot in size and therefore in hiring methods. Some shops, for instance, do not hire any worker: shop managers buy recyclable waste from neighbouring households who come to sell it directly to their shop. Most shops, however, hire daily or monthly workers to collect waste with carts and sometimes to sort through and slightly process the recyclables (by flattening metal or plastic objects, for instance). Some hire children as workers but a big part of the work is done by adults: it includes heavy lifting as well as managing relations with households and with other businesses. The bigger CSs tend to buy exclusively from smaller CSs and sell directly to large recycling factories in industrial zones. While they do not necessarily need to hire waste collectors, they hire workers who sort out the waste with their hands. Big CSs in Thingangyun do not seem to hire children, which is why they were not included as case studies in this section.

The first CS that the team attempted to visit refused entry to the premises. During a previous visit, CESVI Community Facilitators had seen children working in the CS. The team therefore went on to interview other shop owners and workers. When assessing health and safety hazards, the interviewers collected many observations but did not conduct in-depth surveys of the hazards present at the workplaces. The case studies do mention particularly alarming hazards such as blood-filled syringes, but it was neither the aim of this study nor was it possible to examine in great detail the contents of the waste present at each workplace.

#### b. Case study n° 1: small collecting shop, 2 workers, visited in March 2014

- This collecting shop's owner is 39 years old and opened his business 14 years ago. He possesses a license to operate. Metal objects, glass bottles and piles of paper are accumulated in front of the one-story shop, inside the shop and in a backyard where a 16-year-old worker sorts out the recyclables. The owner and his wife live in a house nearby, where they host the worker and store around 15 waste-collection trolleys. A second 'permanent' worker, who is one of the shop owner's relatives, contributes to collecting, sorting and delivering the waste for a daily pay of 6,000 Kyats. This shop owner does not buy recyclables from street children since he owns trolleys and can hire workers to operate them when he needs to. It closes on public holidays.
- The 16-year-old worker started working a month before the research team visited the shop. Having left school in grade 8 (around 12 years old), he used to work on his parents' rice paddies before working for a shop selling car parts in his native town, 2 hours' drive from Yangon. This worker has 3 siblings, 2 of which live in his native town. His older brother works in a collecting shop in Saw Bwar Gyi Gone wholesale market and had recommended him to this CS. This worker lives at the shop owner's house, where he usually goes directly after his day's work from 8:30am to 5:30/6:30pm. After work, he usually showers, eats and watches TV. He is paid less than the other worker because he is hosted and fed. The owner said that he pays the worker 30'000 Kyats a month and the boy said he earns 50,000 Kyats, which he intends to send to his family. Since he had only been working there for 1 month at the time of the interview, there could have been a discrepancy between promised wage and actual wage.

When asked about his tasks, this worker declared that his employer is good-natured because he asks him to segregate the waste but does not ask him to carry heavy loads. The owner explained to the research team that he hires additional workers when he needs heavy loads to be carried. The worker has had no major injury beyond small cuts; the owner has told him that he would take him to a clinic if he were to be sick.

This worker left school because he had to work to support his parents, but said he will go back to school if given the chance. He explained that he feels terrible each time he sees children in uniforms on their way to school. Community Facilitators felt that he looked anxious and tired throughout the discussion they had with him. In the future, he wants to sell car parts in his native town. This could suggest that he preferred his previous work and life situation.

c. Case study n° 2: Small collecting shop, 2 workers, visited in February 2014

- This shop's business consists in collecting small piles of recyclables in front of the owner's house and segregating them before selling them on to a bigger CS in Saw Bwar Gyi Gone wholesale market, three times a week. As the research team arrived, the owner first expressed a reluctance to allow discussions to take place, before accepting quickly. This man stated that he had been working in CSs since 2006, and had started his own business two days before the interview. When asked, he said that he buys recyclables from 'street children' and from cart pushers who usually come to his shop around 8 pm. Since the interviewee gave potentially contradictory indications, stating both that his shop sold waste three times a week and that he had started his business two days before, his indications should be interpreted with some distance. Similarly, this man declared that he hired no workers. In front of his house, two children (12 and 14 years old) were sorting plastic objects with their bare hands for him, including bloodied syringes. Using chopping knives, they were removing metal parts from plastic cans.
- One 14-year-old boy appeared to be doing most of the sorting and arranging of the collected waste. He told the interviewer he had been working at that shop every day from 8 am to 8 pm for 2 months, earning 3'000 Kyats a day on average. When the owner had been asked how regularly the children work at his shop, he had replied that they were only there for the day because it was a school holyday. The boy had left school when he was in grade 5 (about 9 to 10 years old), and told the interviewer that he had engaged in any specific activity since. When asked how he felt about school, the boy replied that he would not want to go back and explicitly said that he was working there according to his own will. He lives close to the shop with his family (8 siblings) and goes back home for lunch. If sick or lightly injured because of his job, he is treated by his parents. He has apparently had no major work-related injury. The interviewing team noted that the boy did not smile back at anybody at any point during the visit. He was frowning and looked tense apart from a short moment when he sat down with the interviewer. He was barefoot as the interview team arrived, and put flip-flops on a moment later.
- Another boy declared that he was 12 years old and had been working there since 2 days before the interview day for 1,500 Kyats per day. This boy also explained that he has been going back home for lunch every afternoon. He declared his father and himself to be the family's breadwinners and said that his younger siblings go to school. He had been giving the money earned during the 2 days of work to his family. He explained that 3 or 4 waste picking 'street children' had been coming to their shop from time to time, but not every day. It was very difficult to catch his attention or to make him develop his answers.

d. Case study n° 3: small collecting shop, 3 workers, visited on March 2014

- This collecting shop collects various sorts of recyclable waste, including a significant amount of cardboard, which fills his indoor space while the rest of the waste is piled in bags all along a pathway lining the property he is renting. The owner hires 3 workers, one of which is an adult whose pay is 6,000 Kyats per day, another who is paid 4,000 Kyats per day, and a 15-year-old who is paid 2,000 Kyats per day. He provides a sleeping space for his workers who come from places that are too far for them to commute, and expects them to work from 10am to 10/11pm. They all break during the afternoon to have a lunch provided by the owner. At the time of the interview, the shop was selling cardboard for 130 Kyats a piece to a business that was uploading it on a truck. 2 syringes, one of which still contained blood, were lying on the floor in the shop. When asked about them, the owner said he would leave them there or put them in garbage bins: he did not intend to sell them on. It was noted that this shop owner

was particularly comfortable discussing his work and letting team members walk about his small shop without necessarily following them.

- A 15-year-old boy was the only worker present at the shop during the visit. He left school after grade 3 (when he was about 7 or 8 years old) and sold vegetables in his native town before working at a CD shop and starting this new job 6 months before the time of the interview. While his mother would have wanted him to stay at school, this boy preferred to start working. This worker goes back home at the end of each month to bring money to his family who lives about 1.5 hours' drive from Yangon. He sometimes buys gold with his salary. His mother and 3 sisters, 1 of which is married, who work in Downtown Yangon. He said he works from 9 am to 9 pm at night except on Hindu religious days. When asked what difficulties he encounters in his everyday work, the worker complained about needle punctures and other small cuts, which he covers with bandages. He also declared that working in the sun and heat induces headaches against which the shop owner provides helpful tablets.

This worker told the interviewer that he has friends in the neighbourhood, but is always too tired at night to meet up with them. He sometimes falls asleep before having had dinner because of this tiredness. He explained that the part of his job he enjoys is the task of segregating and selecting tins, plastic and iron objects, but he does not enjoy having to carry bagfuls of them, as he is regularly asked to when collecting or delivering recyclables. Overall, this boy seemed particularly positive about his work and about the future, declaring enthusiastically that his plan was to open his own CS one day. During the interview, he smiled and appeared to be calm.

e. Case study n°4 small collecting shop, 4 workers, visited in March 2014

- This shop manager opened a collecting shop in 2011 when he ceased to work on his farm. The shop manager complained about a monthly rent of 100,000 Kyats, and said he might have to move his shop in the two months following the interview. When asked, he declared that he had never had to deal with a major worker injury at his shop, only with small cuts that he treated with creams. The shop closes during the water festival and religious days. If he requires an additional worker, he hires one for 2,000 Kyats a day and provides lunch and dinner.
- A 16-year-old had been working at this shop for 6 months at the time of the interview. His father is a truck driver and he has two younger siblings, both at school in grades 5 and 3. He left school after grade 7 (about 11 years old) because his family needed financial support. He earns around 80,000 to 90,000 Kyats a month, and sends part of his salary back to his family. This salary seems to be particularly high when compared to that of the other children interviewed. He does not go back home often, however, and explained that he does not have days off. Most days, he works from 6:30 am until 8 or 9 pm, depending on the work needed. He was carrying heavy loads during the team's visit, including big metallic parts. He was also using a chopping knife. However, he said that he had never been badly injured and had never been to the clinic up to then.
- This worker said he was happy to be trained in this work because he wants to open another shop someday, not by himself but jointly with a family member. Overall, he said he would rather work and learn at that shop rather than study at school. He said that he does not see time go by while he works because he is so busy. When he takes a break, he does not feel the need to leave the shop where he feels comfortable. He sleeps inside the shop, which includes a vast courtyard full of piles of waste and a room with a wooden platform. The interviewing team noted that this worker seemed cheerful during the discussion and comfortable in his working environment.

f. Commentary on the work of children in collecting shops

The following commentary is mostly based on the four case studies above. While it seems that no or few other CS in Thingangyun hire children on a regular basis, these observations should be treated as

preliminary. There could be other children in CSs that Community Facilitators could not locate or access who could be in worse working conditions in Thingangyun. Moreover, the working conditions of children in CSs could be worse in other neighbourhoods and suburbs of Yangon.

No apparent work-induced injuries or illnesses could be observed during the research and all children were apparently being paid for their work. All of them had been to school before starting work at a CS. Nevertheless, the research suggests that all the children were hired for hazardous work according to the ILO Convention on the Worst Forms of Child Labour, work that is “likely to harm the health, safety or morals of children”. Moreover, the conditions detailed below coincide with the ILO’s Worst Forms of Child Labour Recommendation according to which children under the age of 18 years old can be found to be in the worst forms of child labour if exposed to a set of hazardous tasks or situations. The situations outlined by the recommendation that coincide with the observations made in CS are the exposition to:

- dangerous machinery, equipment and tools,
- manual handling or transport of heavy loads,
- an unhealthy environment exposing workers to hazardous substances, agents or processes, or to temperatures, noise, levels or vibration damaging to health,
- work under difficult circumstances, including long hours, or during the night

### ***Observations concerning the working Age***

While one of the interviewed children was under 13 years old, all the others were allegedly old enough to be employed in shops under Myanmar Law. None of the young workers interviewed had been working in the CSs for more than six months. While these declarations may have been inaccurate, it seems at least that none of them had been working there for years and that very young children tend not to be involved in CS in Thingangyun. All interviewed children had spent several years at school before starting to work, and none of them appeared to have just left school because of their job at a CS. Instead, they had either worked somewhere else previously or spent time at home without income.

The children interviewed were respectively 12, 14, 15, 16 and 16 years old. According to international guidelines, this means that one of them should not have been working altogether, another one could only have been doing “light work” and the remaining three could have been doing any work that was not considered hazardous or another Worst Form of Child Labour.

### ***Noticeable health and safety hazards***

None of the workers interviewed could be seen to have suffered from any illness or injury beyond a small cut, and none complained about injuries or accidents. Although they declared that they had contracted no illness or disease, the team could not check whether the children were infected by any disease. What the team observed, however, is that the workers were exposed to health hazards that meant they were definitely exposed to serious health and safety risks. The health hazards included:

- direct contact with household waste (no masks, no gloves, at times no shoes)
- direct contact with used needles
- manipulation of chopping knives
- contact with sharp glass and metallic recyclables (resulting in reported cuts)
- heavy loads
- work in the sun for protracted hours
- work at night, until 10 or 11 pm

### ***Concerns about the working Schedule***

All of the interviewed children worked for longer hours than those prescribed by Myanmar Law, and most of them were not given a weekly day off. However, they seemed to be off work on certain public or religious holydays. They worked respectively for 12hrs, 9 to 10hrs, 12 hrs, and 12,5 to 13,5 hrs per day, sometimes beyond the legally required closing time of 9:30 pm. While lunch breaks are not accounted for in this estimation, the children tended to say that they did not stop for long. Given the nature of the work performed, it makes little sense to compare these working hours to the number of hours prescribed under international law: this neither constitutes light work nor work that is part of the educational development of the children. These long hours can lead to high level of tiredness and other induced health risks.

### ***Other important observations***

- All of the children observed and interviewed were boys. This could have to do with the fact that girls are disproportionately represented in domestic work.
- The pay of children is lower than that of adults, and it was difficult to verify whether there was a correlation with productivity.
- Children are disproportionately given a ‘dirty’ job. It is not necessarily the most difficult job physically but in three shops they appeared to be the only ones with the task of sorting through the waste that arrived from households. They would be the ones most likely to handle needles, syringes and bloodied medical waste, for example.
- One out of 5 children explained that he would like to be back at school, but the 4 others said they would rather work and earn money. 3 out of 5 expressed a feeling of satisfaction at being able to provide their families with income.
- Most of the children live at the owner’s house or inside the shop (dirty conditions). This situation could potentially lead to abuse, but this was not verified. This situation could also constitute forced labour in itself, in particular if a third party, such as a parent, is forcing the children to work there and collecting their wage.

## **4. The involvement of minors in recycling shops and small recycling factories**

### **a. Overview**

There are few RSs and RFs operating in Thingangyun, since most are relocating to other parts of the city. They are small businesses in comparison to many of the recycling factories that operate in Yangon’s industrial zones. Several of these shops hire young workers when the work demanded does not require adult physical strength (so as heavy lifting). The that the research team visited do not buy from street children’ as they tend to specialise and buy their recyclables directly from businesses or from small collecting shops.

There does not appear to be a major difference in terms of the work performed by young workers in RSs and in RFs. In both cases, they process a raw material into a product, often a finished product. The Factories Act of 1951 defines a factory as any premise “where a ‘manufacturing process’ is carried out by 10 or more workers using power or 20 or more workers without any power.” While the RFs visited clearly fell under that category, it appears that the RSs also seemed to. The difference in terminology used by the actors on the ground possibly comes from the fact that so-called ‘recycling shops’ process first-hand recyclables whereas factories use previously processed recyclables as their raw material. It is neither a clear-cut nor a consensual distinction, however. While RSs have a direct contact with either CSs or ordinary shops who provide raw materials, recycling factories do not necessarily have such a direct link with recyclable waste. A significant difference lies in the contact that the workers have with recyclable waste: some RS workers are touching and

cleaning recyclables whereas RF workers are in contact with partially cleaned-up, transformed or processed recyclables. There could therefore be a reduced risk of contamination by contact with bacteria for RF workers, for example. On the other hand, RF workers use dangerous tools and machines more regularly. Overall, however, this does not appear to create a fundamental qualitative difference to the working environment, which is why the two types of business are being analysed jointly here.

Several of the RFs that the research team attempted to visit had been moved to industrial zones a few weeks or months before as a result of neighbours complaining about the generated noise. In some cases, discussions held with workers in RS and RF could not be as long as those held in CSs. The sound of the machines made it difficult to communicate, which in itself is an indication of the working conditions.

b. Case study n° 5: tin recycling shop, 20 workers, visited in February 2014

This shop owner had 20 people working in her premises at the time of the interview, over half of which were minors. Some are daily workers, but most are paid at the end of the month. Most of them eat and sleep at the shop, and interviewers were told that their working times are 8 am to 7 pm. The shop owner said that she had been running this business for 13 years. She buys tins from teashops and pays trolley men for transportation. When asked whether the children work at her shop every day of the week, she said that this was the case but defensively argued that she takes them to visit pagodas on public holidays. The research team found that she was following interviewers closely, which made it difficult to have personal discussions with workers.

The team spoke to a woman who works in this shop with her 14-year-old girl, the two of them working for an average of 5,000 Kyats per day altogether. They are paid 1,500 Kyats for 1,000 tins washed and 700 Kyats for 1,000 tins cut with scissors. Now 37, this woman said that she had been doing this job since she was 14. When she needs money, she can borrow some from the shop owner. There are no set days off but she can request one if needed.

2 boys and 3 girls live at the shop without their family, some children explained that they send back the money earned to their families who live in the countryside. These are the reported ages, activities and corresponding monthly wages:

- A 15 year old girl, washing used condensed milk tins, earns 40,000 Kyats per month, once had a bad injury, a cut in the arm, and was given an injection (against tetanus?).
- A 14 year old girl, cutting tins with big scissors, works there since she was 13, earns 40,000 Kyats per month.
- A 13 year old girl, cutting tins for 40,000 Kyats /month, explains that she sends back money to her family. When asked whether she had ever had injuries, said no, that she is used to the work. Her 14-year-old brother also works there
- A 14 year old boy, the 13 year old's brother, handling a heavy hammer to re-shape tins, working for 30,000 Kyats per month.
- A 16 year old girl, handling a heavy hammer to re-shape tins, working there since she was 13 years old for 50,000 Kyats per month.
- A 15 year old boy, operating a small machine, working here since he was 13 years old, for 25,000 Kyats per month (his work is said to be easier)
- A 21 year old worker, operating a machine, has been working here for 1 year at the time of the interview, for 150'000 Kyats per month. He said he was paid more because his work is more dangerous and technical.

The rest of the workers were men, all operating machines and paid more than the children. None were required to carry heavy loads and none reported health issues.

c. Case study n° 6: bottle-cap factory visited in February and March 2014

This small RF employs about 15 daily workers to process metal plates obtained from flattened-out used tins into bottle-tops, including two young workers. 4 men including one minor (17 years old) were operating machines that day and 11 women were painting the produced bottle caps. The owner declared that his factory closes every Sunday. When they were interviewed, the girls kept working at a very high pace.

The young workers, who work from 7 or 8 am to 5:30 pm, 6 days a week, included:

- A 14-year-old girl who has apparently been working there since she was 12 or 13 years old. This girl declared to be working until 5pm every day for 2,500 Kyats. She is the experienced worker who makes the least money (older workers make up to 4,000 Kyats a day), apparently because she is the least “skilful”. The factory owner explained that workers were paid 1,700 Kyats per 10,000 painted bottle caps. The observation time did not allow to check whether this girl was actually less efficient or whether she was paid less because of her age. When asked what would happen if she ever got injured or a work-related illness, she said she believes her employer would send her to hospital. Observations and discussions with other workers suggested that this job did not present much safety risks to the workers’ health. However, long term health issues resulting from direct contact with and breathing vapours of the paint must be taken into account as safety risks. Moreover, the workers were working at a very high pace, repeating the same movements for protracted periods of time, and sitting in the same position on the floor. While she does not find her work difficult in itself, she finds her long commuting time to be particularly tiring. If required to carry a heavy bag of painted bottle-caps, she asks an adult colleague to carry it for her. She breaks for lunch at 12 but eats as quickly as possible because she is worried that she won’t get her work done.

In the future, this girl wants to become a singer. In her free time, she practices singing. In April 2014, she will quit her job to live with her uncle who wants her to go back to school. She does not want to go to live with her uncle who lives on a farm, but thinks it’s a good idea to start school from grade 7 again. Her parents are divorced and live in the region of Mandalay, so she lives with her grandmother who packs her lunch every day and to whom she gives her pay.

- A boy who declared to be 17 but looked younger had been operating a machine at this factory for 4 to 5 months for 2,400 Kyats per day, making bottle caps out of metal plates from flattened tins. He explained that he gives part of that money to his mother, saves another amount personally and spends the rest. His work does not include heavy lifting but his hand got caught in the machine when he first arrived at the shop. The owner took him to a clinic and gave him a month’s paid leave. The middle finger of his right hand is now shorter than the two fingers surrounding it.

This worker left school when he was in grade 9, he says his friends are now in grade 11, which would mean they are 15. This suggests the boy himself might be 15 year-old. He prefers work to school because he could not focus when he was at school. What he liked at school was being able to play football, and this is what he now does in his free time. He lives close by to the factory and takes an hour off to go home for lunch. He does not know what he would like to do after this job.

- On the second visit day, there were 2 other girls, one 13 years old, the other 17 years old, who had arrived there to work during the summer holyday. There was also a new 17 year-old worker who had arrived 2 days before. Since there was no difference in working condition to those of the 14 year-old interviewed above, the interviews are not included here. They all said they were working there because their parents were not making enough money. As beginners, they are paid 1,700 Kyats per day. The 13-year-old wants to become an artist, the 17 year old who is also working for the summer would like to

become a teacher, and the girl who had just started as a permanent worker would like to open a shop in her native town in the future.

- A woman in her fifties who was painting bottle caps explained that she was happy to work there and that it was beneficial to her health because it kept her busy and active.

#### d. Commentary on the work of children in recycling shops and recycling factories

The following commentary is based on observation of the work done by 12 children working in the RSs and RFs visited. From these observations, the conditions in which the children work are generally different than those of CS workers. Firstly, they have less direct contact with waste and when they do, they tend to be touching recyclables that come directly from shops or other RSs and that have not been taken from household waste or from the street. The other main difference is that some of them spend most of their time operating hazardous tools such as chopping knives, hammers or machines, while CS workers only use them sporadically. Finally, they appeared to be less isolated than the children working in CS since they worked in groups alongside each other, some of them being related to each other, some of them coming from the same native town.

A girl and a boy reported having been injured once. It can be expected that workers who would have been even more heavily injured during work would not necessarily have been able to work anymore and so not identifiable by the research team. Overall however, the conditions appeared to be better than in CSs. Nevertheless, several conditions detailed below coincide with the ILO's Worst Forms of Child Labour Recommendation according to which children under the age of 18 years old can be found to be in the worst forms of child labour if exposed to a set of hazardous tasks or situations. The situations outlined by the recommendation that coincide with the observations made in CS are the exposition to:

- dangerous machinery, equipment and tools,
- an unhealthy environment exposing workers to hazardous substances, agents or processes, or to temperatures, noise, levels or vibration damaging to health,
- work under difficult circumstances, including long hours, or during the night

#### ***Working Age***

None of the children observed at the premises in Thingangyun were below the legal age of 13, and it seemed that none of them had started working before the age of 13. Nevertheless, given the health and safety hazards described below, they were too young to be doing that work according to international standards.

#### ***Health and Safety hazards***

Both RS and RF explained that neighbour had been complaining about noise. This suggests that the noise inside the working place are particularly loud. The team also noticed the following health hazards:

- handling sharp and of dangerous tools and machines
- constant skin contact with sharp tins and paint, no protection (no gloves, no masks)
- repetitive physical work for long hours

#### ***Concerns about the working Schedule***

The reported working schedules are respectively of about 11 and 10 hours a day. The working times seem generally shorter than in CS which are smaller and more family-based.

### ***Other important observations***

- In opposition to CSs, the majority of the workers at the RS and the RF were women and girls. However, no woman or girl was seen to be operating a machine, only men and boys. In another recycling shop in Thingangyun, one that produces cardboard, the owner had stated that she only trusted men and boys to operate machines because they were smarter than the girls she hired.
- The RF case-study n°6 is interesting because all of the children interviewed for this research expressed plans to stay in the same industry they were already working in, except for the two girls who were only working for the holyday and for the 14 year-old-girl who was about to go back to school a month later. These girls stated future plans outside the recycling sector, such as becoming a singer, an artist, a teacher.

## **5. Additional observations and conclusion**

To a lesser extent, the team also observed the involvement of children in SWM and recycling in other parts of Yangon. These observations lead to the following additional observations:

- The team went to Saw Bwar Gyi Gone wholesale market. Some children worked in the compound and there was one major difference with the other places visited: they were carrying heavy loads. One 15-year-old showed damaged skin where he had been carrying recyclables-filled bags bigger than him. It also appeared that some very young children were working in the compound, doing a similar job to their parents who were waste collectors. The team met two brothers who were respectively 6 and 8 years old. They said they helped their parents during the school holyday, and usually made about 3'000 Kyats per day. These children were the youngest that the team met and they were working within and outside the compound, where there are hundreds of shops and trucks, unattended.
- Many recycling shops and recycling factories in Hlaing Tharyar hire children. On one occasion, in a small recycling shop, the team met a girl who had never been to school and who did not know her own age. She looked slightly older than her 11-year-old brother who had only spent one year at school. They live at their workplace and their mother drops by once a month to collect their pay from their employer. Such a scenario is a form of abuse that could be termed forced labour.
- At Hlaing Tharyar dumping site, there were some children at a RS. Contact with waste was clearly much more important than in CSs, since the workers were standing on it. An additional health hazards was the presence of pigs eating waste around the RS. The pigs appeared to belong to the RS, and would present a high health hazard if eaten since they were themselves eating waste all day.

\* \* \*

As demonstrated, many of the children met during this research were working in hazardous conditions, in what is recognised as a Worst Form of Child Labour according to international standards. Working in the child labour is also incompatible with many of the rights of the child outlined in the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child. Of highest concern is their direct contact with waste and handling of dangerous instruments, but also their long working hours and the fact that they are living at their workplace and often give away their pay to their families. Although they explained that they were supporting their families, there is a fine line between what can be considered as forced labour and abuse or even slavery, and what is not considered as such. This issue is of very high concern and should be taken on by the concerned Myanmar departments and international organisations investigating forced labour in Myanmar.

## **V. Recommendations to the SWM project, to future developers of SWM in Yangon and to researchers**

Cesvi recognises international standards on children employment and aims to advocate for those standards in Myanmar while recognising Myanmar Law. The modification of the Myanmar Child Law of 1993 is an ongoing process and it is hoped that it will have some impact towards a stronger protection of working children under Myanmar Law. Moreover, the development of SWM in Yangon in line with the project's aims is set to diminish the involvement of private businesses in waste collection and recycling and this change would diminish the involvement of children and the risks they run. In the meantime, the project intends to promote safe working conditions for children working in the SWM and recycling sector, in line with Myanmar law.

### ***1. Keeping children safe***

The message must be spread that the activities detailed in this paper are inappropriate for children. Overall, children should not be involved in SWM. Children should not be in direct contact with waste, whether they are working in SWM or recycling, whether they are helping their parents who work in the sector, or for any other reason. The health and safety risks described in this paper are to be taken seriously as they can severely impact the physical, mental and social development of the child. Similarly, children should not be handling dangerous instruments and machines that can lead to cuts and burns. They should not be working more than the legal working hours or beyond official closing hours. Children have a right to breaks and to days off.

### ***2. Continue to monitor the state of children's involvement in SWM***

Promoting the welfare of working children requires a monitoring of the situation in Yangon. To the researcher's knowledge, this study is the only one of its kind and it is focused on one township of Yangon. Further information is needed given the work conditions observed in this research.

### ***3. Develop awareness and motivation throughout the SWM<sup>2</sup> partnership***

The involvement of minors in SWM is not a central theme of the project proposal but appears to be relevant and one whose importance is demonstrated by this paper. This insight into child labour should be shared with the project partners so that the project can develop child protection awareness. This could entail developing training materials on OHS issues relating to PCCD staff and other workers.

### ***4. Integrate this topic to the awareness campaign***

The topic of child safety at work in particular and OHS in SWM in general can be integrated to the awareness campaign contained under part 3 of the project. It is necessary to spread information about the hazardous nature of waste and its effects on child development. This can also be shared with households since children can also be in contact with waste when playing in the streets or handling household waste. The need for a safe working environment together with limited working hours can be explained to all employers and employees in SWM and recycling.

### ***5. Document and collect positive experiences***

Yangon is not the first city where the problems identified in this research arise, and unfortunately SWM by far isn't the only sector where workplaces are unsafe for workers, including children. A next step would

therefore be to collect positive experiences of actions that have led to a strengthening of workplace safety in similar contexts in order to know how this could be done in SWM and recycling in Yangon.

#### ***6. Organise a workshop with specialists***

This paper's findings give reason to discuss the problem further with NGOs involved in child protection in Yangon. This includes informing the experts who were contacted for this research about the research's findings and be invited to share their perspective on potential action towards limiting the involvement of children in SWM. Among others, a roundtable could bring together child protection specialists from Save the Children, Terre des hommes and World Vision.

#### ***7. Incorporate the issue in the new SWM by-laws***

The first component of the project is working on developing SWM by-laws. Issues pertaining to the involvement of children in SWM should be considered in the drafting of these laws. It should reflect the risks posed by the employment of children in the sector and provide clear directions on how to deal with these issues.

#### ***8. Encourage the study of the cultural perception of child workers in Myanmar***

Throughout this research, it was apparent that the work of children is widely visible and accepted in Myanmar. However, no specific research could be found on the Myanmar perspective on child labour. It is necessary to gather all research that has been done on the topic and conduct further research on the issue.

## VI. Bibliography

### 1. Primary sources

#### International Law:

- Convention on the Worst Forms of Child Labour (n°182), ILO, 1999
- Worst Forms of Child Labour Recommendation (n° 190), ILO, 1999
- United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC), 1990
- Convention on the Minimum Age for Admission to Employment (n°138), ILO, 1973

#### Myanmar Law:

- The Child Law, 1993
- The Factories Act, 1951
- The Shops and Establishments Act, 1951

### 2. ILO publications on Child Labour

- ‘Marking progress against child labour – Global estimates and trends 2000-2012’ (2013a), International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour, ILO, Geneva.
- ‘World report on child labour’ (2013b) International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC), ILO, Geneva.
- ‘Towards the elimination of hazardous child labour... Practices with good potential’ (2012a) International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC), ILO, Geneva.
- The Tripartite Process of determining hazardous child labour: Guide for facilitators - Eliminating hazardous child labour: Step by step’ (2012b) International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC), ILO, Geneva.
- ‘Children in Hazardous Work – What we know, What we need to do’ (2011), International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour, ILO, Geneva.
- ‘Practical Guide to Child Labour Reporting’ (2006) International Training Center of the International Labour Organization, Turin.
- ‘Manual on Child Labour Rapid Assessment Methodology’, (2005) Statistical Information and Monitoring Programme on Child Labour (SIMPOC) and International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC), ILO, Geneva.
- ‘Myanmar Ratifies the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention’, ILO Press Release, 19<sup>th</sup> of December 2013, accessed on the ILO website on 14<sup>th</sup> February 2014. [[http://www.ilo.org/global/standards/informationresourcesandpublications/news/WCMS\\_233060/lang--en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/global/standards/informationresourcesandpublications/news/WCMS_233060/lang-en/index.htm)]
- ‘ILO lifts remaining restrictions on Myanmar’, ILO Press Release, 18<sup>th</sup> of June 2013, accessed on the ILO website on the 20<sup>th</sup> of February 2014. [[http://www.ilo.org/ilc/ILCSessions/102/media-centre/news/WCMS\\_216355/langen/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/ilc/ILCSessions/102/media-centre/news/WCMS_216355/langen/index.htm)]

- 'ILO, Myanmar sign agreement on National Labour Force Survey', ILO Press Release, 14<sup>th</sup> of November 2013, accessed on the 20<sup>th</sup> of February 2014. [[http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/activities/all/WCMS\\_229675/lang--en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/activities/all/WCMS_229675/lang--en/index.htm)]

#### **4. Literature on SWM and Occupational Health and Safety**

- Awan, S. A., (2003) 'Occupational Health and Safety Risk Assessment of Child Labour in Scavenging Sector in Lahore', *Centre for the Improvement of Working Conditions & Environment, Labour & Human Resource Department, Government of the Punjab, Lahore*. (check Reliability/Quality!)
- Cointreau, S., (2006) 'Occupational and Environmental Health Issues of Solid Waste Management – Special Emphasis on Middle- and Lower-Income Countries' *The World Bank Group, Urban Sector Board, Urban Papers*.
- Gunn, S. E., and Ostos, Z., 'Dilemmas in tackling child labour: The case of scavenger children in the Philippines' *International Labour Review*, 131.6, pp.629-646.
- Medina, M., (1997) 'Informal Recycling and Collection of Solid Wastes in Developing Countries: Issues and Opportunities' *The United Nations University Institute of Advanced Studies Working Paper no.24*.
- Minn, Z., Srisontisuk, S., and Laohasiriwong, W., (2010) 'Promoting People's Participation in Solid Waste Management in Myanmar' *Research Journal of Environmental Sciences*, 4:3, pp.209-222.

#### **6. Other useful sources:**

- Friedor Jeske's feasibility study [once official version comes out]
- 'Conducting semi-structured interviews' Oxfam Research Guidelines (online resource), Oxfam GB 2012.

## **VII. Annex**

### ***Guidelines for conducting interviews with working children Intended for Community Facilitators and other interviewers***

The following basic rules will be followed in order to conduct respectful and ethical interviews:

#### **Before interviews**

- Team members will always introduce themselves and explain the purpose of the interviews to the interviewees. Community Facilitators will ask individuals if they agree to speak with them for a few minutes and whether photographs may be taken during that time. They will only conduct the interview and take pictures if authorisation was granted.
- If minors' parents or guardian are present, interviewers will ask for permission to interview the children and take photographs of them. When there is an employer present at the workplace, the employer's permission will be asked for.

#### **During interviews**

- To the extent possible, interviewers will not interrupt the person's work. If workers are walking around, interviewers will follow them around. If they are standing, interviewers will stand. If they are sitting, interviewers will sit down and always keep their face at their level.
- If possible, interviews will be conducted out of the employer or shop owner's ear sight in order to preserve confidentiality and safety
- Interviewers will assess the vulnerabilities of the interviewees and conduct the discussions accordingly. They will not insist on sensitive topics and they will consider the potential effect of their interview on the worker's feelings and on their everyday work (including relation to employer).
- Interviews will be held as conversations. Interviewers will let the interviewee react to their comments and feel free to talk about anything else before asking further questions or changing the topic. These interviews sometimes are rare occasions when individuals are asked how they feel about their work so it is important to let them express what they want to express.
- When interviewers have to ask direct questions, they will avoid questions that can only be answered by YES or NO. They will prefer 'open questions'. For example, by asking "What was your favourite thing about school?", instead of "Did you like school?"

#### **After the interviews**

- Information collected, including photographs, will not be shared beyond the research team and Solid Waste Management project coordinators before the final report is ready.
- Personal information collected during field research that could lead to identification (names, addresses) will not appear in the final report. Before including photographs in the report, the research team will take into consideration danger of identification and risks of social stigma.

**အခြားသောတွေ့ဆုံမေးမြန်းသူများနှင့် Community Facilitators များအတွက်ရည်ရွယ်ထားသော ကလေးအလုပ်သမားများနှင့်အပြန်အလှန်မေးမြန်းပြောဆိုမှုလမ်းညွှန်ချက်များ ရန်ကုန်တွင်းSWMတွင်ပါဝင်သောသက်ငယ်အလုပ်သမားများပတ်သတ်သည့်သုတေသ**

အောက်ပါအခြေခံစည်းမျဉ်းများသည် အမြဲတမ်းလိုက်နာရမည်။

**မေးမြန်းမှုပတ်ဝင်စင်**

- အဖွဲ့သားများသည်မိမိကိုယ်ကိုမိတ်ဆက်ရန်၊အဖွဲ့၏လုပ်ဆောင်ချက်ကိုရှင်းပြရန်။ အချိန်အနည်းငယ်ကြာစကားပြောဆိုပြီးခွင့်ပြုချက်ရပြီးလျှင် တစ်ဦးချင်းကိုCFများမှမေးရန်နှင့် မေးမြန်စဉ်ခါတ်ပုံများရိုက်ကူးရန်။
- ထိုသို့ဆောင်ရွက်မှုများကိုပိုင်ရှင်၏ခွင့်ပြုချက်ရမှသာဆောင်ရွက်ရန်။
- အုပ်ထိန်းသူ(သို့)မိဘများထံမှခွင့်ပြုချက်ရသောလျှင်မေးမြန်းသူသည်ကလေးများ၏ခွင့်ပြုချက်ကိုတောင်းခံပြီးမေးရန်နှင့်ခါတ်ပုံရိုက်ရန်။
- အလုပ်ချိန်အတွင်းအလုပ်လုပ်နေသောသူကိုမေးမြန်းလိုလျှင်၎င်းထံမှခွင့်ပြုချက်တောင်းရမည်။

**မေးမြန်းနေစဉ်**

- မေးမြန်းသူသည်ဖြစ်နိုင်သမျှအလုပ်ကိုအနှောက်အယှက်မပြုရပါ။
- အလုပ်လုပ်သူလမ်းလျှောက်သွားရင် သူ့နောက်ပြီးမေးပါ။မတ်တပ်ရပ်နေလျှင်မတ်တပ်ရပ်ပြီးမေးပါ
- ထိုင်နေလျှင်ထိုင်ပြီးမေးပါ။အမြဲသူတို့၏မျက်နှာနှင့်ဆုံတွေ့နိုင်သောအနေအထားတွင်နေပါ။
- ယုံကြည်မှုနှင့်လုံခြုံမှုကိုကာကွယ်ရန် ဖြစ်နိုင်လျှင်ပိုင်ရှင်ကြားနိုင်သောနေရာကိုရှောင်ပြီးဆောင်ရွက်ပါ။
- မေးမြန်းခံရသူ၏အားနည်းချက်ကိုအကဲခတ်ရလိမ့်မည်အပြင်အပြန်အလှန်မေးမြန်းမှုကိုလည်း လျှော့ညီစွာဆောင်ရွက်ပါ။
- သူတို့ဟာအထိမခံနိုင်တဲ့ခေါင်းစဉ်မျိုးကိုတောင်းဆိုမှာမဟုတ်ဘူး၊သူတို့ခံစားမှုတွေနှင့်တစ်နေ့တာအလုပ်တွေဟာသူတို့ရဲ့အဖြေပေါ်တွင်အကျိုးဆက်ဆက်ပြီးပါဝင်လာပါလိမ့်မယ်။
- မေးမြန်းမှုတွေကိုအပြန်အလှန်ပြောဆိုမှုတွေနဲ့ပြုလုပ်ရမယ်။မေးခွန်းတွေနောက်ထပ်မမေးခင်(သို့)မေးခွန်းပြောင်းမမေးခင် သူတို့ရဲ့အကြံပေးချက်၊လှုပ်လပ်စွာပြောဆိုမှုနှင့်တုံ့ပြန်မှုစသည့် အရာများကိုခွင့်ပြုရမယ်။
- အခုလိုမေးမြန်းမှုတွေဟာကြိုရခဲတယ်။တစ်ဦးချင်းစီကိုသူတို့ရဲ့အလုပ်ပေါ်ဘယ်လိုခံစားရလည်း မေးတဲ့အခါ အဲဒီမေးခွန်းဟာသူတို့ဖော်ပြချင်တဲ့အရာကိုဖော်ပြခွင့်ပြုဖို့အရေးကြီးပါတယ်။
- မေးခွန်းတွေမေးရသောခါ ဟုတ်ပါတယ်(သို့)မဟုတ်ပါဘူးလို့ဖြေမယ့်မေးခွန်းတွေကိုရှောင်ပြီး မေးရမယ်။ သူတို့တွေဟာ open question ကိုပိုကြိုက်တယ်။ ဥပမာ- ကျောင်းကိုကြိုက်လားလို့မေးမယ့်အစားကျောင်းနဲ့ပတ်သတ်ပြီးဘယ်အရာကို နှစ်သက်သလဲလို့ မေးခြင်း။

**မေးမြန်းပြီးနောက်**

- နောက်ဆုံးသတင်းပို့ချက်မတိုင်ခင်ခါတ်ပုံအပါဝင်သတင်းအချက်များကိုသုတေသနအဖွဲ့နှင့် SWMစီမံခန့်ခွဲမှုများမှကျော်လွန် ဝေမျှမည်မဟုတ်။နောက်ဆုံးသတင်းပို့ချက်တွင်လည်းနာမည်၊ လိပ်စာများကိုလည်းဖော်ပြမည်မဟုတ်ပါ။